

Available online at www.sciencedirect.com



ATMOSPHERIC ENVIRONMENT

Atmospheric Environment 41 (2007) 9543-9554

www.elsevier.com/locate/atmosenv

# Assessment of yield losses in tropical wheat using open top chambers

R. Rai, M. Agrawal\*, S.B. Agrawal

Department of Botany, Ecology Research Laboratory, Banaras Hindu University, Varanasi 221005, India

Received 22 May 2007; received in revised form 14 August 2007; accepted 23 August 2007

## Abstract

The present study deals with the evaluation of effects of ambient gaseous air pollution on wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L. var. HUW-234) growing in a suburban area situated in eastern Gangetic plain of India, using open top chambers. Eight hourly air monitoring was conducted for ambient concentrations of  $SO_2$ ,  $NO_2$  and  $O_3$  in filtered chambers (FCs), non-filtered chambers (NFCs) and open plots (OPs). Various morphological, physiological and biochemical parameters were assessed during different developmental stages and finally yield parameters were quantified at the time of harvest.

Mean concentrations of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> were 8.4, 39.9 and 40.1 ppb, respectively during the experiment in NFCs. Concentrations of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> reduced by 74.6%, 84.7% and 90.4%, respectively in FCs as compared to NFCs. Plants grown in FCs showed higher photosynthetic rate, stomatal conductance, chlorophyll content and Fv/Fm ratio as compared to the plants in NFCs and OPs. Lipid peroxidation, proline, total phenol and ascorbic acid contents and peroxidase activity were higher in plants grown in NFCs. There were improvements in morphological parameters of plants growing in FCs as compared to those in NFCs and OPs. Yield of plants also increased significantly in FCs as compared to those ventilated with ambient air (NFCs) or grown in OPs. During the vegetative phase, NO<sub>2</sub> concentrations were higher than O<sub>3</sub>, but O<sub>3</sub> became dominant pollutant during the time of grain setting and filling. The study concludes that O<sub>3</sub> and NO<sub>2</sub> are the main air pollutants in the sub-urban areas causing significant yield reductions in tropical wheat plants. (© 2007 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

Keywords: Open top chambers; Ozone; Sulphur dioxide; Nitrogen dioxide; Effects; Wheat

# 1. Introduction

Ambient air pollution has been shown to reduce the growth and economic yield of a wide range of major crop species in the United States (Heck et al., 1988), Switzerland (Fuhrer et al., 1989), Sweden (Pleijel et al., 1991), Germany (Adaros et al., 1990),

fax: +91 542 236 8174.

E-mail address: madhoo58@yahoo.com (M. Agrawal).

China (Wang et al., 2007), Pakistan (Wahid, 2006a, b), Japan (Kobayshi et al., 1995), Malaysia (Ishii et al., 2004) and Thailand (Ariyaphanphitak et al., 2005). Negative effect on crop yield under ambient air pollution was largely attributed to secondary air pollutant ozone ( $O_3$ ), known to be highly phytotoxic. Ozone concentrations have increased considerably during the last century throughout the world. Ozone formation speeds up under conditions of bright sunlight, high temperatures and low wind speed. Other gaseous pollutants

<sup>\*</sup>Corresponding author. Tel.: +91 542 236 8156;

 $<sup>1352\</sup>text{-}2310/\$$  - see front matter C 2007 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved. doi:10.1016/j.atmosenv.2007.08.038

such as nitrogen dioxide  $(NO_2)$  and sulphur dioxide  $(SO_2)$  also pose negative influence on crop yield (Heck et al., 1988).

Impact of ambient air pollution particularly of  $O_3$ on agricultural crops has been well documented in temperate countries through projects such as US Assessment Network National Crop Loss (NCLAN) (Heck et al., 1988) and European Crop Loss Assessment Network (EUCLAN) using open top chambers (OTCs). The magnitude of yield reductions varied from species to species and frequency of  $O_3$  events that occurred during the growing season (Fuhrer et al., 1989). Both NCLAN and EUCLAN studies have clearly shown reductions of wheat yield due to elevated ambient O<sub>3</sub> concentrations over the growing period at different locations (Fuhrer et al., 1989; Pleijel et al., 1991).

Recent studies conducted in Asia showed high mean  $O_3$  concentrations in Seoul (Jo et al., 2000), Hong-Kong (Lee et al., 2002), Tokyo (Wakamatsu et al., 1999), Pakistan (Wahid et al., 1995) and India (Agrawal et al., 2003). In contrast to the research outputs from developed nations on impact of ambient air pollution on crops, the numbers of case studies from developing countries are very few (Tiwari and Agrawal, 2006; Wahid, 2006a, b; Wahid et al., 1995, 2001). Air pollutant concentrations are increasing rapidly in many developing countries due to rapid economic transformation, industrialization and urbanization accompanied with increase in energy demands (Agrawal, 2005). Number of motor vehicles in India has increased from 21.3 million in 1991 to 67.0 million in 2003. Energy consumption in India is  $12.8 \times 10^{12}$  Btu. More traffic on roads and other transport sectors using dirtier fuels have changed the pattern of air pollutant concentrations in ambient air of urban areas. Atmospheric pollutants generated in urban-industrial areas spread to long distances from the place of origin to influence the suburban and rural areas supporting agriculture (Agrawal et al., 2003; Singh et al., 2005: Wahid, 2006a, b).

Agricultural productivity is needed to be enhanced to cope up the growing population of the country along with a steadily rising standard of living. Wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L.) is one of the major staple crops in India and grown over 26.4 million ha. Along with certain problems in agronomic practices and natural calamities, ambient air pollution could be one of the major factors for not achieving the target set for production of wheat crop in the country. During 2003–2004 the goal for

yield was 78 Mt, however, only 72.06 Mt was achieved. Giles (2005) has predicted  $O_3$  as a threat likely to cause major problems in countries that are rapidly industrializing, such as India and China. Keeping the above fact in view, the present study was undertaken to evaluate the pattern of changes in morphological, physiological, biochemical and yield characteristics of wheat (*T. aestivum* L. cultivar HUW-234) under current levels of ambient air pollutants using OTCs in a suburban area of a medium sized Indian city.

The hypothesis of the study was that  $O_3$  and  $NO_2$ are the major air pollutants at experimental site situated in suburban area, affecting the physiological, biochemical and growth characteristics of wheat plants negatively. The higher concentrations of  $O_3$ particularly during anthesis period may cause more adverse impact on yield attributes of wheat as the sensitive stages of reproductive development are more severely affected due to their limited capacity to compensate for any losses of reproductive sites.

# 2. Material and methods

## 2.1. Study area

The study was conducted at the Agricultural Farm of Banaras Hindu University, a suburban area of Varanasi located in the eastern Gangetic plains of the Indian subcontinent at 25°14'N latitude, 82°03'E longitude and 76.1 m above mean sea level between the months of December, 2004 and March, 2005. This period of the year is characterized by mean monthly minimum temperature varying from 10.4 to 17.9 °C and mean monthly maximum temperature from 22.1 to 32.7 °C. Total rainfall was 115.6 mm, maximum recorded during February. Maximum monthly relative humidity ranged from 72.8% to 86.8% and minimum monthly relative humidity from 33% to 55.8%. The monthly variations in climatological data are given in Table 1. Soil at the study site was sandy loam in texture (sand 45%, silt 28% and clay 27%) with pH of 7.2.

# 2.2. Open top chambers

Six OTCs of 1.5 m diameter and of 1.8 m height were established at the experimental site following the design of Bell and Ashmore (1986). The details of OTCs design are described in Tiwari and Agrawal (2006). Each of the chambers was attached

Table 1 Meteorological data of the experimental site during the study period

Month/year	Rainfall (mm)	Mean temperature (°C)		Relative humidity (%)		Sunshine (h)
		Max.	Min.	Max.	Min.	
December 2004	0.0	23.7	10.8	86.8	49.3	6.3
January 2005	30.1	22.1	10.4	87.6	54.0	5.9
February 2005	48.5	26.1	14.3	84.3	55.8	8.6
March 2005	37.0	32.7	17.9	72.8	33.0	9.5

to high speed blowers with air supplied at three changes  $\min^{-1}$ . Three chambers were ventilated with ambient non-filtered air (non-filtered chambers: NFCs) and another three with air that passed through activated charcoal filters (filtered chambers: FCs). All chambers were provided with prefilters to remove the dust. Three open plots (OPs) were also kept for studying the chamber effects on crops growing in OTCs. The treatments were distributed randomly. Microclimatic measurements were taken within and outside the chambers at 0900, 1300 and 1700 h at canopy height. It was found that temperature and relative humidity were 0.1-0.2 °C and 2-4% more in the chambers. The light intensity in the chambers was 95% of the ambient level in the OPs.

# 2.3. Plant material

Wheat (*T. aestivium L.*) cultivar HUW 234 was chosen for experiment because it is a highly recommended and widely grown variety for North-eastern plain zone of India. This variety of wheat is double gene dwarf variety developed from pedigree method by involving HUW 12/Sparrow/HUW12. HUW 234 has drooping leaves and club shaped spikes, having a life span of 120 days and an average height of 85–105 cm. This variety has high resistance against rust, loose smut, karnal bunt, powdery mildew and moderate resistant to leaf blight. This variety of wheat has been shown to be particularly sensitive to  $O_3$  using EDU as a tool to assess the  $O_3$  impact on plants (Tiwari et al., 2005).

Seeds of wheat were hand sown in chambers and in OPs in December 2004. Recommended dose of fertilizers (120, 60 and 40 kg ha<sup>-1</sup> N, P and K as urea, super phosphate and muriate of potash, respectively) were added during preparation of field. Half dose of N and full doses of P and K were given as basal dressing and another half dose of N was given as a top dressing. Plants were thinned to 1 plant every 15 cm. Manual weeding was performed three times over the course of the experiment. Field was irrigated from time to time to maintain the soil moisture uniformly.

# 2.4. Air monitoring

Eight hourly monitoring for O<sub>3</sub>, NO<sub>2</sub> and SO<sub>2</sub> were conducted throughout the growth period of plant. Air samples were drawn through Teflon tube (0.25 m diameters) at canopy height from different chambers between 9:00 and 17:00 h. The sampling tube was moved up as the plants grew. SO<sub>2</sub> was estimated by a SO<sub>2</sub> photometer analyzer (Model 319, Kimoto, Japan).  $O_3$  concentrations were monitored using UV absorption photometric ozone analyzer (Model 400A, API, Inc., USA). Recording of  $O_3$  and  $SO_2$  concentrations were done at 15 min interval. The calibrations of the instruments were conducted weekly by known concentrations of SO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub>. NO<sub>2</sub> was scrubbed in NaOH (0.1 N) and analyzed colorimetrically following the method described by Merrymann et al. (1973).

#### 2.5. Morphological parameters

For growth and biomass determinations, two monoliths  $(10 \times 10 \times 20 \text{ cm}^3)$  containing intact roots were carefully dug at random from each chamber and open plot at 40, 60 and 80 days after germination (DAG). These were thoroughly washed by placing them on a sieve of 1 mm mesh size under running tap water to remove the soil particles. Growth parameters recorded were root and shoot length, leaf area, numbers of tillers and leaves. Leaf area was measured using a portable leaf area meter (Model LI-3100, LI-COR, Inc. USA). Component plant parts were separated and oven dried at 80 °C till constant weight was achieved for biomass determination.

# 2.6. Physiological and biochemical parameters

Photosynthesis rate (Ps), stomatal conductance (Cs), transpiration (Es) and water use efficiency (WUE) were analyzed using portable photosynthetic system (Model LI-6200, LI-COR, USA) between 60 and 64 DAG. The measurements were made on fully expanded flag leaf on cloud free days during 09:00 and 10:00 h local time on three randomly selected plants in each chamber. During the measurements, photosynthetically active radiation ranged between 1100 and 1200  $\mu$ mol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>. The system was calibrated using a known CO<sub>2</sub> source of 509 ppm concentration.

Chlorophyll fluorescence was determined between 10.00 and 11.00 h using portable plant efficiency analyzer (Model, MK2 9414, Hansatech Instrument Ltd., UK) on the same leaf where Ps was measured. Leaf clips for dark adaptation were placed on the adaxial side of the leaves for 10 min before measurement at excitation irradiance of  $200 \,\mu\text{mol}\,\text{m}^{-2}\,\text{s}^{-1}$ . Minimum fluorescence ( $F_0$ ) and maximum fluorescence ( $F_w$ ) were measured from which variable fluorescence ( $F_v$ ) and ratio of variable and maximum fluorescence ( $F_v$ ) were calculated.

Biochemical analyses were conducted only for the plants growing in FCs and NFCs at 40 and 60 DAG. Three plants were randomly harvested from each chamber and leaves were cut down and refrigerated for analyses of photosynthetic pigments, antioxidants and metabolites. Total chlorophyll and carotenoid contents were measured by using the methods of Maclachlan and Zalik (1963) and Duxbury and Yentsch (1956), respectively. Phenol content was determined in acetone extract by using the methodology of Bray and Thorpe (1954). Peroxidase activity and ascorbic acid content were estimated by the methods of Britton and Mehley (1955) and Keller and Schwager (1977), respectively. Proline content was measured by the method of Bates et al. (1973). The extent of lipid peroxidation was estimated as malondialdehyde (MDA) content following the protocol of Heath and Packer (1968).

## 2.7. Yield parameters

Plants were harvested at maturity to assess different yield parameters. Six plants were sampled from each replicate OPs, FCs and NFCs. Number and weight of ears  $plant^{-1}$ , number of grains  $ear^{-1}$ ,

number and weight of grains  $plant^{-1}$ , weight of above ground part and weight of 1000 grains (test weight) were recorded. Harvest index (HI) was calculated as the ratio of weight of grains  $plant^{-1}$  and total above ground biomass of the plant.

## 2.8. Statistical analysis

Growth and biomass data were subjected to twoway ANOVA test for assessing the significance of quantitative changes in different parameters due to treatments at different sampling intervals. Data of yield and physiological characteristics were analyzed for significance of changes due to treatments using one way ANOVA test. Duncan's multiple range test was performed as post hoc on parameters subjected to ANOVA tests. The significance of difference for pigments, chlorophyll fluorescence kinetics, metabolites and enzymes due to treatments was calculated by student's *t*-test. All the statistical tests were performed using SPSS software (SPSS Inc., version 10.0).

## 3. Results

## 3.1. Air quality monitoring

Air monitoring showed higher concentrations of  $SO_2$ ,  $NO_2$  and  $O_3$  in NFCs and OPs as compared to FCs (Fig. 1). Air filtration reduced the concentrations of  $O_3$ ,  $NO_2$  and  $SO_2$  by 90.4%, 84.7% and 74.6%, respectively in FCs as compared to NFCs. During the 4 months growing period of wheat, maximum variations were found with O3 concentration, which increased from a mean concentration of 36.4 ppb in December 2004 to a mean concentration of 48 ppb in March 2005. Concentration of SO<sub>2</sub> was low and it decreased from mean concentration of 11.1 ppb in December to 4.8 ppb in March. Mean concentration of NO2 was highest in the month of December (43.1 ppb), thereafter a decline was observed with minimum concentration recorded during March (38.2 ppb). There was no significant difference in the concentrations of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> between NFCs and OPs.

## 3.2. Morphological parameters

Plants grown in FCs showed increments in growth parameters as compared to those grown in NFCs and OPs (Table 2). ANOVA test showed that variations in morphological parameters were



Fig. 1. Mean concentrations (ppb) of different pollutants at the experimental site (8-h daily mean). Values are mean  $\pm 1$  SE.

significant due to treatment, age and treatment × age interaction except for root length (Table 3). There was an increment of 33.6% in number of tillers at 60 DAG in FCs as compared to NFCs. Number of leaves plant<sup>-1</sup> also increased significantly at both the ages of observations. Leaf area increased significantly by 13%, 31.4% and 31.9% at 40, 60 and 80 DAG, respectively in FCs in comparison to NFCs. Root, shoot and leaf biomass were higher in FCs as compared to NFCs and OPs at 60 and 80 DAG (Fig. 2). Results of two way ANOVA showed that variations in root, shoot and

leaf biomass were significant due to age, treatment and their interaction.

# 3.3. Physiological and biochemical parameters

Photosynthetic rate increased by 27.1% in plants of FCs as compared to those in NFCs (Table 4). Stomatal conductance and transpiration rate also increased significantly in plants grown in FCs (Table 4). No significant differences were observed in photosynthetic rate, stomatal conductance and transpiration rate in plants of NFCs and OPs. Chlorophyll fluorescence measurements showed reduction of 4% and 4.9% in  $F_0$  at 40 and 60 DAG, respectively in FCs as compared to NFCs. Values of  $F_m$  and  $F_v$  showed significant increments in plants grown in FCs at all ages of observations. Similar trend was observed for  $F_v/F_m$  ratio, which was 3.5% and 5.4% higher in plants of FCs than NFCs at 40 and 60 DAG, respectively (Fig. 3).

At all ages of estimation, total chlorophyll and carotenoid contents were higher in plants of FCs as compared to those in NFCs (Fig. 3). Increments were, however, not significant for carotenoid content. Concentration of MDA, an indicator of lipid peroxidation was higher in plants of NFCs as compared to those in FCs (Fig. 3). These increments were 47.4% and 41.6% at 40 and 60 DAG, respectively. Total phenolics were significantly higher in plants of NFCs than FCs (Fig. 4). Observed increments were 23.5% and 38.5% at 40 and 60 DAG, respectively. Peroxidase activity and ascorbic acid content showed increments of 23.4-38.1% and 6.6-11.2%, respectively in plants of NFCs as compared to FCs. Similarly, proline content was 36% and 46.2% higher in NFCs as compared to FCs at 40 and 60 DAG (Fig. 4).

## 3.4. Yield responses

As compared to plants in NFCs and OPs, respectively, number of ears  $plant^{-1}$  increased by 22.2% and 29.6% and weight of ears  $plant^{-1}$  increased by 21.9% and 34.2% in FCs. Similarly, weight and number of grains  $plant^{-1}$  were significantly higher by 20.7% and 14.5%, respectively in FCs as compared to NFCs. There was no significant difference in weight and number of grains  $plant^{-1}$  between NFCs and OPs. Test weight showed an increase of 18.8% in FCs as compared to NFCs. Similarly, significant increase of 8.4% for HI was found in FCs (Table 5).

Table 2

Agewise changes in morphological parameters of wheat plants in filtered chambers (FCs), non-filtered chambers (NFCs) and open plots (OPs)

Parameters	40 DAG			60 DAG			80 DAG		
	FCs	NFCs	OPs	FCs	NFCs	OPs	FCs	NFCs	OPs
Root length (cm)	$11.8 \pm 1.04^{a}$	$9.8 \pm 0.46^{b}$	$8.3 \pm 0.22^{b}$	$13.9 \pm 0.34^{a}$	$12 \pm 0.46^{b}$	$10.3 \pm 0.41^{\circ}$	$16.9 \pm 0.76^{a}$	$16.1 \pm 1.36^{a}$	$13.2 \pm 0.17^{b}$
Shoot length (cm)	$59.8\pm1.9^a$	$53.6 \pm 2.5^{b}$	$45.6 \pm 0.7^{\circ}$	$98.1 \pm 0.27^{a}$	$95.7 \pm 0.88^{a}$	$88.5 \pm 2.32^{b}$	$106.2 \pm 2.02^{a}$	$105 \pm 2.35^{a}$	$97 \pm 1.15^{b}$
No. of tillers $(plant^{-1})$	$10.3 \pm 0.6^{\rm b}$	$7.3 \pm 0.42^{b}$	$4.3 \pm 0.49^{\circ}$	$13.5 \pm 1.75^{a}$	$8.3 \pm 0.21^{b}$	$7.5 \pm 0.43^{b}$	$12\!\pm\!1.7^a$	$11.7 \pm 1.2^{a}$	$10.5 \pm 0.42^{a}$
No. of leaves $(plant^{-1})$	$32.8\pm2.2^a$	$30.3\pm1.5^a$	$19.8 \pm 0.6^{b}$	$47 \pm 8.6^{\rm a}$	$27.5 \pm 2.4^{b}$	$26.2 \pm 0.7^{b}$	$29.8 \pm 1.16^{a}$	$22.5 \pm 1.8^{b}$	$18.8 \pm 0.7^{b}$
Leaf area (cm <sup>2</sup> )	$646.2 \pm 21.9^{a}$	$562 \pm 2.3^{b}$	$546.3 \pm 2.3^{b}$	$933.7 \pm 230.7^{a}$	$639.9 \pm 44.8^{b}$	$621\pm3.1^{\rm b}$	$340.1 \pm 47.1^{a}$	$231.6 \pm 20.4^{b}$	$222.8 \pm 1.94^{b}$

Values are mean  $\pm 1$  SE.

Table 3

Values followed by different letters are significantly different (p < 0.05).

F-ratio and level of significance for morphological parameters of wheat plants grown in filtered chambers (FCs), non-filtered chambers (NFCs) and open plots (OPs)

Parameters	Age	Treatment	Interaction (age × treatment)
Root length (cm)	42.3***	23.3***	0.4 <sup>N.S</sup>
Shoot length (cm)	64.2***	13.0***	2.7*
No. of tillers $(plant^{-1})$	7.5***	13.1***	3.5*
No. of leaves $(plant^{-1})$	5.9**	15.4***	2.9*
Leaf area (cm <sup>2</sup> )	99.6***	16.8***	2.6*
Root biomass (g)	128.8***	48.0***	7.3***
Shoot biomass (g)	759.3***	70.2***	21.0***
Leaf biomass (g)	209.7***	23.6***	3.7***

Level of significance: \*p<0.05; \*\*p<0.01; \*\*\*p<0.001; N.S: not significant.

## 4. Discussion

The field experiment conducted in OTCs clearly showed significant adverse effects of ambient air pollution on wheat plants growing in the suburban areas of Varanasi. The microclimatic conditions only varied to a small extent between the chambers and OPs. The increases in temperature  $(0.1-0.2 \,^{\circ}\text{C})$ within chambers as compared to OPs during the present study were much less than those reported by Wahid (2006a), 1.4 °C and Vandermeiren et al. (1992), 0.8-1 °C. However, the increments in relative humidity (2-4%) inside the chamber observed during the present study were similar to that reported by Wahid (2006a). A 5% reduction in light intensity was observed during the present study, while Ashmore et al. (1988) and Wahid (2006b) reported 7% and 2-6% reductions in light levels, respectively. The lower magnitude of increase

in temperature inside the chambers reflected a better air circulation as compared to other studies (Vandermeiren et al., 1992; Wahid, 2006a). Charcoal filters have very efficiently removed all the pollutants, with maximum filtration of O<sub>3</sub>. Wahid et al. (1995) and Wahid (2006b) also found filtration efficiencies of 87–92% for O<sub>3</sub>. In the present study  $NO_2$  filtration (85%) efficiency was higher than the reported efficiencies of 67% by Wahid (2006b) and 47–58% by Wahid et al. (1995). The air monitoring data clearly showed that SO<sub>2</sub> being low in concentration may not have a major impact on plants in the area. However, the concentration of SO<sub>2</sub> was much above the natural background level and also higher than some of the critical levels used to protect vegetation in Europe (Ashmore and Wilson, 1994). NO<sub>2</sub> and  $O_3$  were the major air pollutants in the area, which may be ascribed to the high vehicular emission in the urban areas of Varanasi.



Fig. 2. Root, shoot and leaf biomass of wheat plants grown in FCs, NFCs and OPs at 40, 60 and 80 DAG. Values followed by different letters are significantly different (p < 0.05).

During the vegetative stage of wheat growth (December-January), temperature and sunlight intensity were low and NO<sub>2</sub> concentrations were higher than O<sub>3</sub>. But, during reproductive period (February-March) temperature and light intensity gradually increased which favoured more  $O_3$ formation thus causing a lower mean concentration of NO<sub>2</sub>, which is a primary precursor for  $O_3$ production. Agrawal et al. (2003) have also reported higher mean concentration of O<sub>3</sub> during summer than winter at suburban and rural sites around Varanasi. The seasonal mean concentrations of all the three pollutants recorded during the present study were lower than the concentrations reported by Wahid (2006a, b) for the same period of time. The pollutant concentrations in NFCs and OPs were similar.

Air pollutants are known to induce oxidative stress in plants after absorption. Presence of  $O_3$ triggers an oxidative burst, leading to production of reactive oxygen species (ROS) (Wohlgemuth et al., 2002) and subsequent lipid peroxidation. In the present study, lipid peroxidation was indicated to be higher in plants of NFCs as compared to those grown in FCs. Lipid peroxidation has been correlated with the damage to membrane in  $O_3$  exposed plants (Calatayud and Barreno, 2004). Cell wall ascorbate provides a first line defence against  $O_3$ and SO<sub>2</sub> fumigations (Castillo and Greppin, 1988). In the present experiment, foliar ascorbic acid content was higher in plants grown in NFCs, which might be a consequence of substantial oxidative stress. Recent studies have shown higher levels of ascorbic acid in the leaf apoplast of O<sub>3</sub> tolerant snap bean (Phaseolus vulgaris L.) genotypes compared with sensitive lines (Burkey et al., 2003). The present test cultivar (HUW-234) of wheat might have increased the defense against oxidative stress by enhancing ascorbic acid content in response to air

Та	ble	4

Variations in physiological characteristics of wheat plants at 60 DAG grown in filtered chambers (FCs) and non-filtered chambers (NFCs)

Parameters	Treatments				
	FCs	NFCs	OPs		
Photosynthesis rate ( $\mu$ mol CO <sub>2</sub> m <sup>-2</sup> s <sup>-1</sup> ) Stomatal conductance (cm s <sup>-1</sup> ) Transpiration rate (mmol m <sup>-2</sup> s <sup>-1</sup> ) Water use efficiency ( $\mu$ mol CO <sub>2</sub> m <sup>-2</sup> s <sup>-1</sup> mmol m <sup>-2</sup> s <sup>1</sup> )	$\begin{array}{c} 16.98 \pm 0.03^{a} \\ 2.91 \pm \ 0.01^{a} \\ 19.43 \pm 0.08^{a} \\ 0.87 \pm 0.004^{a} \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 12.37 \pm 0.06^{\rm b} \\ 2.33 \pm \ 0.18^{\rm b} \\ 15.86 \pm \ 0.09^{\rm b} \\ 0.78 \pm 0.07^{\rm b} \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 12.24 \pm 0.02^{\rm b} \\ 2.26 \pm 0.03^{\rm b} \\ 15.73 \pm 0.02^{\rm b} \\ 0.77 \pm 0.001^{\rm b} \end{array}$		

Values are mean  $\pm 1$  SE.

Values followed by different letters are significantly different (p < 0.05).



Fig. 3. Total chlorophyll and carotenoid contents,  $F_0$ ,  $F_v$  and  $F_v/F_m$  ratio and lipid peroxidation in wheat plants grown in filtered (FCs) and non-filtered chambers (NFCs) at 40 and 60 DAG. Level of significance: \*p < 0.05, \*\*p < 0.01, \*\*\*p < 0.001 and NS = not significant.

pollution stress. Increments in peroxidase activity have also been reported as defensive response under  $O_3$  (Tingey et al., 1975) and  $NO_2$  (Horsman and Wellburn, 1975) stresses. In the present study, ascorbic acid content and peroxidase activity increased with age in wheat plants in NFCs as compared to FCs.

Proline accumulates in plants under environmental stresses to scavenge ROS (Matysik et al., 2002). In the present study, proline content increased in plants grown in NFCs. Pollutants after dissolving in the intercellular fluid of leaves give rise to a series of reactions, which alter the levels of major anions and lead to accumulation of proline (Mansfield and Freer-Smith, 1981). Total phenol content also increased in plants of NFCs. Langerbartels et al. (1990) showed an increase in the phenolic compounds in presence of  $O_3$ . Phenols are responsible for plant resistance against many stresses. Air pollutants including NO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> produce ROS causing widespread damage to membranes and associated molecules, including chlorophyll pigments. In the present investigation total chlorophyll content was lower in plants growing in NFCs as compared to those in FCs. Pleijel et al. (2006) showed significant reduction in chlorophyll content of wheat cv. Dragon and Lantvete under NFCs with additional ozone (+40 ppb) as compared to those in FCs. Agrawal et al. (2003) have also reported reductions in total chlorophyll content of pot grown wheat plants grown under ambient air mainly O<sub>3</sub> and NO<sub>2</sub> in the suburban areas of Varanasi.

Plants grown in NFCs and OPs showed lower rates of Ps, Es and Cs as compared to those in FCs. Temple et al. (1988) found significant reductions in Ps of cotton (*Gossypium hirsutum* L. cv. SJ-2) grown in NFCs and NFCs receiving additional  $O_3$  as compared to NFCs. Decrease in WUE of plants in NFCs as compared to FCs suggest that  $CO_2$  assimilation is more severely reduced than



Fig. 4. Ascorbic acid, proline, total phenol content and peroxidase activity in wheat grown in filtered (FCs) and non-filtered chambers (NFCs) at 40 and 60 DAG. Level of significance: p < 0.05, p < 0.01, p < 0.001 and NS = not significant.

Table 5			
Variations in yield characteristics of wheat plants grown in filtered chambers (FCs) non-f	iltered chambers (	NFCs) and op	pen plots (OPs)

Parameters	Treatments				
	FCs	NFCs	OPs		
Number of ears (plant <sup>-1</sup> )	$14.5 \pm 0.42^{a}$	$11.6 \pm 0.66^{b}$	$10.2 \pm 0.47^{\rm b}$		
Weight of ears $(g plant^{-1})$	$29.6 \pm 0.88^{a}$	$23.2 \pm 1.01^{b}$	$19.5 \pm 0.76^{\circ}$		
Number of grains (plant <sup>-1</sup> )	$568 \pm 14.3^{a}$	$485.8 \pm 18.89^{\rm b}$	$475.1 \pm 12.9^{b}$		
Weight of grains $(g plant^{-1})$	$27.2 \pm 1.02^{a}$	$21.6 \pm 0.94^{\rm b}$	$20.3 \pm 0.13^{b}$		
Test weight (g)	$45.3 \pm 2.30^{a}$	$36.8 \pm 1.06^{\rm b}$	$32.4 \pm 1.08^{b}$		
Harvest index $(gg^{-1})$	$0.39 \pm 0.01^{a}$	$0.37\pm0.04^{\rm a}$	$0.33 \pm 0.008^{a}$		

Values are mean  $\pm 1$  SE.

Values followed by different letters are significantly different (p < 0.05).

transpirational water loss, which indicated more pollutant effect at the mesophyll level. Wahid (2006a) reported significant reductions in Ps and Cs of three cultivars of wheat grown in OTCs with mean seasonal concentrations of 71 ppb  $O_3$ , 30 ppb NO<sub>2</sub> and 16 ppb SO<sub>2</sub>. The decrease in Ps could also be attributable to decrease in Cs in plants of NFCs as compared to FCs during the present study. O<sub>3</sub> is found to induce stomatal closure of varying degree leading to reduction in stomatal conductance (Guidi et al., 1997). The reduction in Ps due to O<sub>3</sub> exposure has often been correlated with lower carboxylation efficiency due to  $O_3$  effects on enzymes of Calvin cycle (Zheng et al., 2002). Rate of photosynthesis of flag leaves declined by 40% in wheat cv. Satu due to exposure of 45 ppb  $O_3$ , 8 h daily for 4 weeks during anthesis (Ojanpera et al., 1998). In the present study also mean  $O_3$  concentration was more than 40 ppb during the anthesis period of wheat. This period is the most important for  $O_3$  effects on grain yield in cereals (Pleijel et al., 1998).

The fluorescence induction kinetics measurement done during the present study showed higher constant yield  $(F_0)$ , whereas variable fluorescence  $(F_v)$  reduced for plants grown in NFCs. Increase in  $F_0$  suggests structural alteration at PSII (Krause and Weis, 1984), whereas lowering of  $F_v$   $(F_m-F_0)$  indicates thylakoid damage. Significant reduction in  $F_v/F_m$  ratio in plants of NFCs as compared to FCs indicated that polluted ambient air modified the photochemistry of PSII. Wahid (2006a) also reported significant reductions in  $F_v/F_m$  ratio of three varieties of wheat grown in unfiltered air and ambient air as compared to those in filtered air.

The negative effects of NO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> present in ambient air of NFCs on physiological and biochemical characteristics of plants led to significant reductions in growth and biomass accumulation in plants as compared to those in FCs. Reduction in leaf area may reduce absorption of radiation and subsequently reduction in net assimilation per unit ground area. Heagle et al. (2000) have reported 7% decline in leaf area in NFCs and 69% in NFCs with additional O<sub>3</sub> for a wheat variety C9904. Wahid (2006a) recorded significant decline in flag leaf area of three varieties of wheat grown in NFCs and OPs as compared to FCs. Number of tillers declined in NFCs and OPs as compared to FCs. Wahid et al. (1995) reported 25.9% and 31.8% reductions in number of tillers in wheat varieties Pak-81 and Chakwal-86, respectively grown in NFCs as compared to those in FCs.

No significant effects of filtration were recorded on biomass of root, shoot and leaves at 40 DAG. However, at 60 and 80 DAG reductions were significant in NFCs. During early vegetative growth of wheat  $NO_2$  concentrations were higher than  $O_3$ , but at anthesis period O3 became predominant pollutant.  $NO_2$  is less phytotoxic than  $O_3$  at comparable concentrations causing significant yield losses (Capron, 1994). Reductions in component wise biomass of plants in NFCs are directly correlated to the pollutant-induced changes in morphological, physiological and biochemical characteristics. Results of two-way ANOVA test showed that there is a consistent significant effect of treatment on growth parameters and biomass of wheat plants along with its increasing age.

In the present study, yield decreased by 20.7% at seasonal mean concentrations of 41.8, 39.9 and 8.5 ppb  $O_3$ ,  $NO_2$  and  $SO_2$ , respectively. Yield reductions recorded in the present study are greater than other studies conducted in Europe (Fuhrer et al., 1989; Pleijel et al., 1991) using OTCs, but lower than observations made by Wahid et al. (1995). Wahid et al. (1995) recorded yield reductions of

35% and 47% in wheat cultivars Pak-81 and Chakwal-86, respectively grown in chambers ventilated with ambient air compared with charcoal filtered air. Wahid (2006a) reported reductions of 43%, 39% and 18% in seed weight  $plant^{-1}$  of Pasban 90, Puniab 96, and Ingilab 91 varieties of wheat, respectively at seasonal mean concentrations of 70, 28 and 15 ppb O<sub>3</sub>, NO<sub>2</sub> and SO<sub>2</sub>, respectively in Lahore, Pakistan. Pleijel et al. (1991) reported yield reductions of 13% in wheat at 7-h mean concentrations of 42 and 44 ppb O<sub>3</sub> during two seasons in Sweden. In Switzerland, Fuhrer et al. (1989) also reported 6% reduction in 1000 grain weight in NFCs as compared to FCs. In European studies cited above yield reductions were found at mean O<sub>3</sub> concentrations of 40-50 ppb throughout the growth period of wheat, while in the present investigation such concentrations were achieved during later stages of plant growth.

HI is a parameter, which indicates the partitioning of dry matter between grain and above ground biomass. Reduction in HI of plants in NFCs and OPs as compared to FCs indicated that relatively less dry matter was partitioned into grain under pollutant stress of ambient air. Fuhrer et al. (1989) and Pleijel et al. (1991) have also found reductions in HI of wheat at higher mean O<sub>3</sub> concentrations causing significant yield losses. Sexual reproductive development is a crucial stage in the life cycle of seed crop plants and any impairment of the process has significant implications for productivity of these plants. Huxiang et al. (2005) reported that winter wheat grown in Yangtze Delta in China was adversely affected by O<sub>3</sub> because it is typically sown in October or November and harvested in May or June. The high springtime  $O_3$  concentrations are of particular concern as they coincide with the timing of the environmentally sensitive stages in the winter wheat i.e. anthesis and grain filling (Slaughter et al., 1989). A similar seasonal variation in O<sub>3</sub> concentration was observed during the anthesis and grain filling stages of wheat during the present study. Black et al. (2000) have shown that current ambient levels of  $O_3$  in many industrialized countries reduced the grain and fruit yields and adversely affected the yield quality.

## 5. Conclusion

The present study showed that  $NO_2$  and  $O_3$  were the main pollutants of concern in ambient air of suburban areas of Varanasi. Higher concentrations of NO<sub>2</sub> along with the low mean O<sub>3</sub> concentration during vegetative phase did not cause significant effects on growth and biomass accumulation in plants in NFCs and OPs. But during anthesis and grain filling stages at higher mean O<sub>3</sub> concentrations, significant reductions in various parameters were observed in plants grown in NFCs. This indicates that higher  $O_3$  concentrations particularly at the reproductive stage of wheat led to significant yield reductions. Comparison of wheat responses grown in FCs with NFCs and OPs clearly showed improvements in different physiological, biochemical and morphological parameters of wheat plants under condition of pollutant exclusion in FCs. Yield attributes have also showed improvements when grown in FCs as compared to NFCs and OPs. This suggests that ambient air quality in suburban areas of Varanasi has potential negative impact on wheat growth and yield. Comparison of yield losses reported for temperate wheat cultivars at more or less similar O<sub>3</sub> concentrations as measured during the present study, showed that the test tropical cultivar is more sensitive than temperate cultivars.

## Acknowledgments

The authors are thankful to the University Grant Commission and Council of Scientific and Industrial Research, New Delhi for providing financial support to the work. Richa Rai is grateful to Center of Advanced Study in Botany, Banaras Hindu University, Varanasi for awarding Junior Research Fellowship.

#### References

- Adaros, G., Weigel, H.J., Jager, H.J., 1990. Effects of incremental ozone concentrations on the yield of bush beans (*Phaseolus vulgaris* var. nanus (L.) Aschers). Gartenbauwissenschaft 55, 162–167.
- Agrawal, M., 2005. Effects of air pollution on agriculture: an issue of national concern. National Academy Science Letter 28, 93–106.
- Agrawal, M., Singh, B., Rajput, M., Marshall, F., Bell, J.N.B., 2003. Effect of air pollution on peri-urban agriculture: a case study. Environmental Pollution 126, 323–329.
- Ariyaphanphitak, W., Chidthaisong, A., Sarobol, E., Bashkin, V.N., Towprayoon, S., 2005. Effects of elevated ozone concentrations on Thai jasmine rice cultivars (*Oryza sativa* L.). Water, Air and Soil Pollution 179–200.
- Ashmore, M.R., Wilson, R.B. (Eds.), 1994. Critical Levels in Europe. Department of the Environment, London.
- Ashmore, M.R., Brown, V., Kristansen, L., Shah, D., 1988. Effects of ambient air pollution, water stress and aphid pests

on Vicia faba. In: Bonte, J., Mathey, P. (Eds.), CEC Air Pollution Report No. 19. CEC, Brussels, pp. 8–25.

- Bates, L.S., Waldren, R.P., Teare, I.D., 1973. Rapid determination of free proline for water stress studies. Plant Soil 39, 205–207.
- Bell, J.N.B., Ashmore, M.R., 1986. Design and construction of open top chambers and method of filtration (equipments and cost). In: Proceedings of the Second European Open Top chambers Workshop. Freiburg, CEC, Brussels.
- Black, V.J., Black, C.R., Roberts, J.A., Stewart, C.A., 2000. Impact of ozone on the reproductive development of plants. New Phytologist 147, 421–447.
- Bray, H.G., Thorpe, W.Y., 1954. Analysis of phenolic compounds of interest in metabolism. Methods of Biochemical Analysis 1, 27–52.
- Britton, C., Mehley, A.C., 1955. Assay of catalase and peroxidase. In: Colowick, S.P., Kalpan, N.O. (Eds.), Method in Enzymology. Academic Press Inc., New York.
- Burkey, K.O., Eason, G., Fiscus, E.L., 2003. Factors that affect leaf extracellular ascorbic acid content and redox status. Physiologia Plantarum 117, 51–57.
- Capron, S.J.M., 1994. Critical levels for NO<sub>2</sub>. In: Ashmore, M.R., Wilson, R.B. (Eds.), Critical Levels of Air Pollutants for Europe. Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions, London, UK, pp. 48–54.
- Calatayud, A., Barreno, E., 2004. Response to ozone in two lettuce varieties on chlorophyll a fluorescence, photosynthetic pigments and lipid peroxidation. Plant Physiology and Biochemistry 42, 549–555.
- Castillo, F.J., Greppin, H., 1988. Balance between anionic and cationic extracellular peroxidase activities in *Sedum album* leaves after ozone exposure: analysis by high-performance liquid chromatography. Physiologia Plantarum 68 (2), 201–208.
- Duxbury, A.C., Yentsch, C.S., 1956. Plankton pigment monographs. Journal of Marine Research 15, 19–101.
- Fuhrer, J., Egger, A., Lehnherr, B., Grandjean, A., Tschannen, W., 1989. Effects of ozone on the yield of spring wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L., cv. Albis) grown in open-top field chambers. Environmental Pollution 60, 273–289.
- Giles, J., 2005. Hikes in surface ozone could suffocate crops. Nature 435, 7.
- Guidi, L., Nali, C., Ciompi, S., Lorenzini, G., Soldatini, G.F., 1997. The use of chlorophyll fluorescence and leaf gas exchange as methods for studying the different responses to ozone of two bean cultivars. Journal of Experimental Botany 48, 173–179.
- Heagle, A.S., Miller, J.E., Pursley, W.A., 2000. Growth and yield responses of winter wheat to mixtures of ozone and carbon dioxide. Crop Science 40, 1656–1664.
- Heath, R.L., Packer, L., 1968. Photoperoxidation in isolated chloroplast. I. Kinetics and stoichiometry of fatty acid peroxidation. Archives of Biochemistry and Biophysics 125, 189–198.
- Heck, W.W., Taylor, O.C., Tingey, D.T., 1988. Assessment of Crop Loss from Air Pollutants. Elsevier, New York.
- Horsman, D.C., Wellburn, A.R., 1975. Synergistic effect of SO<sub>2</sub> and NO<sub>2</sub> polluted air upon enzyme activity in pine seedlings. Environmental Pollution 8, 123–133.
- Huxiang, W., Kiang, C.S., Xiaoyana, I., Xiujic, Z., Chameides, W.L., 2005. Surface ozone: a likely threat to crops in Yangtze delta of China. Atmospheric Environment 39, 3843–3850.

- Ishii, S., Marshall, F.M., Bell, J.N.B., 2004. Physiological and morphological responses of locally grown Malaysian rice cultivars (*Oryza sativa* L.) to different ozone concentrations. Water, Air and Soil Pollution 205–221.
- Jo, W.K., Yoon, I.H., Nam, C.W., 2000. Analysis of air pollution in two major Korean cities: trends, seasonal variations, daily 1-h maximum versus other hour-based concentrations, and standard exceedances. Environmental Pollution 110 (1), 11–18.
- Keller, T., Schwager, H., 1977. Air pollution and ascorbic acid. European Journal of Forest Pathology 7, 338–350.
- Kobayshi, K., Okada, M., Nouchi, I., 1995. Effect of ozone on dry matter partitioning and yield of Japanese cultivars of rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). Agriculture, Ecosystems and Environment 53 (2), 109–122.
- Krause, G.H., Weis, E., 1984. Chlorophyll fluorescence as a tool in plant physiology. II. Interpretation of fluorescence signals. Photosynthesis Research 5, 139–157.
- Langerbartels, C., Heller, W., Kerner, K., Leonardi, S., Rosemann, D., Schraudner, M., Trest, M., Sandermann, H.J., 1990. Ozone induced defense reaction in plants. Environmental research with plants in closed chambers. In: Air pollution Research Report of the EC26. Economic European Community, Brussels, pp. 358–368.
- Lee, Y.C., Calori, G., Hills, P., Carmichael, G.R., 2002. Ozone episodes in urban Hong Kong 1994–1999. Atmospheric Environment 36, 1957–1968.
- Maclachlan, S., Zalik, S., 1963. Plastid structure, chlorophyll concentration and free amino acid composition of a chlorophyll mutant of barley. Canadian Journal of Botany 41, 1053–1062.
- Mansfield, T.A., Freer-Smith, P.H., 1981. Effects of urban air pollution on plant growth. Biological Review 56, 343–368.
- Matysik, J., Alia, P., Bhalu, B., Mohanty, P., 2002. Molecular mechanisms of quenching of reactive oxygen species by proline under stress in plants. Current Science 82, 525–532.
- Merrymann, E.L., Spicer, C.W., Levy, A., 1973. Evaluation of arsenite-modified Jacobs–Hochheiser procedure. Environment Science and Technology 7, 1056–1059.
- Ojanpera, K., Patsikka, E., Ylaranta, T., 1998. Effects of low ozone exposure of spring wheat on net CO<sub>2</sub> uptake, Rubisco, leaf senescence and grain filling. New Phytologist 138, 451–460.
- Pleijel, H., Skärby, L., Wallin, G., Selldén, G., 1991. Yield and grain quality of spring wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L., cv. Drabant) exposed to different concentrations of ozone in open-top chambers. Environmental Pollution 69, 151–168.
- Pleijel, H., Danielsson, H., Gelang, J., Sild, E., Sellden, G., 1998. Growth stage dependence of the grain yield response to ozone in spring wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L.) 70, 61–78.
- Pleijel, H., Eriksen, A.B., Danielsson, H., Bondesson, N., Sellden, G., 2006. Differential ozone sensitivity in an old and a modern Swedish wheat cultivar-grain yield and quality, leaf chlorophyll and stomatal conductance. Environmental and Experimental Botany 56, 63–71.
- Singh, A., Agrawal, S.B., Rathore, D., 2005. Amelioration of Indian urban air pollution phytotoxicity in *Beta vulgaris* L. by

modifying NPK nutrients. Environmental Pollution 134, 385–395.

- Slaughter, L.H., Mulchi, C.L., Lee, E.H., Tuthill, K., 1989. Chronic ozone stress effects on yield and grain quality of soft red winter wheat. Crop Science 29, 1251–1255.
- Temple, J.P., Kupper, R.S., Lennox, R.L., Rohr, K., 1988. Physiological and growth responses of differentially irrigated cotton to ozone. Environmental Pollution 53, 255–263.
- Tingey, D.T., Fites, R.C., Wickliff, C., 1975. Activity changes in selected enzymes from soybean leaves following ozone exposure. Physiologia Plantarum 33, 316–320.
- Tiwari, S., Agrawal, M., 2006. Evaluation of ambient air pollution impact on carrot plants at a suburban site using open top chamber. Environmental Monitoring and Assessment 119, 15–30.
- Tiwari, S., Agrawal, M., Manning, W.J., 2005. Assessing the impact of ambient ozone on growth and productivity of two cultivars of wheat in India using three rates of application of ethylenediurea (EDU). Environmental Pollution 138, 153–163.
- Vandermeiren, K., De Temmerman, L., Staquet, A., Baeten, H., 1992. Effects of air filteration on spring wheat grown in opentop field chambers at a rural site. II. Effects on mineral partitioning, sulphur and nitrogen metabolism and grain quality. Environmental Pollution 77, 7–14.
- Wahid, A., 2006a. Influence of atmospheric pollutants on agriculture in developing countries: a case study with three new varieties in Pakistan. Science of Total Environment 371, 304–313.
- Wahid, A., 2006b. Productivity losses in barley attributable to ambient atmospheric pollutants in Pakistan. Atmospheric Environment 40, 5342–5354.
- Wahid, A., Maggs, R., Shamsi, S.R.A., Bell, J.N.B., Ashmore, M.R., 1995. Air pollution and its impact on wheat yield in the Pakistan, Punjab. Environmental Pollution 88, 147–154.
- Wahid, A., Milne, E., Shamsi, S.R.A., Ashmore, M.R., Marshall, F.M., 2001. Effects of oxidants on soybean growth and yield in the Pakistan. Environmental Pollution 113, 271–280.
- Wakamatsu, S., Uno, I., Ohara, T., Schere, K.L., 1999. A study of relationship between photochemical ozone and its precursor's emissions of nitrogen oxides and hydrocarbons in Tokyo and surrounding area. Atmospheric Environment 33, 3097–3108.
- Wang, X., Zheng, O., Yao, F., Chen, Z., Feng, Z., Manning, W.J., 2007. Assessing the impact of ambient ozone on growth and yield of a rice (*Oryza sativa* L.) and a wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L.) cultivar grown in the Yangtze Delta, China using three rates of application of ethylene diurea (EDU). Environmental Pollution 148, 390–395.
- Wohlgemuth, H., Mittelstrass, K., Kschieschan, S., Bender, J., Weigel, H.J., Overmyer, K., Kangasjarvi, J., Sandermann, H., Langebartels, C., 2002. Activation of an oxidative burst is a general feature of sensitive plants exposed to the air pollutant ozone. Plant, Cell and Environment 25, 717–726.
- Zheng, Y., Shimizu, H., Barnes, J.D., 2002. Limitation of CO<sub>2</sub> assimilation in ozone-exposed leaves of Plantago major. New Phytologist 155, 67–68.